

Equal Dignity and Respect for Human Beings Committee Report

Introduction and Summary of Major Positions

The well-being of a society depends on the physical, mental, emotional, and economic well-being of its constituents; yet vast segments of Utah's population are being left behind, year after year, in spite of the importance of their contributions to our state's economy. Women, racial and ethnic minorities, and LGBTQ individuals represent *more than half* of the state's population, and policymakers must do more to understand and address their needs and aspirations if Utah is to achieve the robust economic future to which it aspires.

The coronavirus pandemic, recession, and civil unrest have drawn attention to realities that can no longer be ignored, including longstanding gender and racial inequities in our state's economy. When states ordered schools and restaurants shut down and small businesses closed, 60 percent of the eliminated jobs were held by women;¹ and many more were made dramatically more precarious due to the loss of care services for children, the elderly, the sick, and those with disabilities. Higher COVID infection rates among racial and ethnic minority groups present compelling evidence of the physical, economic, and emotional challenges those communities face.²

An expansive vision of the under-utilized potential of Utah's increasingly diverse population is essential as Utah rebuilds post pandemic, to sweep away barriers and open doors of opportunity and economic dignity for all, and to ensure a robust economy for Utah in the years ahead. The following priorities are expanded in the material in subsequent pages.

- **Utah's future economic well-being is critically dependent upon the work of women, minorities, and LGBTQ people.** Policymakers, governmental entities, educators, health care providers, economic development advocates, and employers all need to better understand Utah's rapidly changing demographic trends and develop opportunities for our changing local population that reduce discriminatory impacts on their employment.
- **Authentic dialogue** with women and representatives of Utah's minority communities on specific challenges they face would help illuminate the compelling stories behind the statistics and unequivocally illustrate how current public policies unfairly impact the lives of real people and real families throughout our state.
- **Transitioning to a minimum wage of \$15/hour** would serve to lift a significant percentage of the population out of poverty and put even more individuals and families on the path to economic dignity, security, and success.
- **The Governor's Office of Economic Development should assess the adequacy of its approach to bringing jobs to Utah** in ways that highlight the experience of women, minorities, and LGBTQ individuals in the economy. Well-paying jobs for non-college-educated women and minorities should be a high priority, as well as policies that promote wealth acquisition among low-income minorities.
- **Criminal justice reform is a critically important component of the work before policymakers** in addressing the needs of minority communities, but it cannot succeed in the absence of well-paying employment opportunities, access to safe and affordable housing, access to good schools, child care, health care, and community-conscious safety and emergency services.

Women

Despite decades of work by the Governor’s Commission on the Status of Women,³ the more recent Women in the Economy Legislative Commission,⁴ and the tireless efforts of the Utah Women & Leadership Project,⁵ Utah retains its reputation as a place where women are not treated equally.⁶ This report offers a partial explanation for the continued economic inequality experienced by Utah women by focusing on the *invisible* unpaid and paid care work they do.

Care work involves providing a face-to-face service to children, the elderly, the sick, and the disabled. This work may be done in the household (both paid and unpaid), in the informal market (e.g., babysitting, elder care, domestic work), or the formal labor market (e.g., teachers, nurses, and other essential workers).⁷ Although men are becoming more involved in housework and childcare in the home, women remain accountable for the quality of care.⁸

Official GDP statistics do not attempt to account for the value of care work done in the home. By its very nature, the work is largely invisible.⁹ Care work becomes visible only when the quality of care declines or when resources are strained. For example, the care work of mothers became more visible during the COVID-19 pandemic as women struggled to manage employment expectations as well as increased food production and home-schooling responsibilities,¹⁰ with diminished childcare options and availability.¹¹

Childcare. Forty-four percent of the labor force in Utah are women who average 33 hours of work per week, and women who work full time and year-round contribute almost \$40,000 a year to household income. Sixty-one percent of mothers with children under 6 years old and 74 percent of mothers with children ages 6-17 are employed.¹² Utah women are, therefore, significant contributors to the economic viability of their families and the state’s economy.

Childcare is an essential form of care work. Employed women with young children at home are dependent on the help of others when it comes to providing care while they meet the demands of their paid work. *Utah’s current childcare system only meets about one third of the need.*¹³

Like roads, bridges, and communications systems, *childcare is part of the basic infrastructure of our society*—it is infrastructure for families,¹⁴ and it, too, is essential for keeping our economy going. Utah policy makers must give greater priority to the care work that women do. At a minimum, this means policies that support the childcare needs of working women.¹⁵ “Working parents should not be forced into a Faustian bargain of not working because they have no one to care for their child.”¹⁶

The Wage Gap. The wage gap in Utah is among the largest in the nation. Women earn only 70 cents for every dollar that men make.¹⁷ The wage gap is generally explained by the type of jobs women select, inequalities in education, and discrimination.

Historically, as women entered the labor force, they continued to do the kinds of care work they had always done in their homes. Schools hired women to teach; hospitals hired women as nurses and nurses’ aides; eating establishments hired women to prepare and serve food; and businesses

hired women as secretaries to manage the routine activities of their organizations. Women's wages are, therefore, often lower because of the care occupations they choose.

Women dominate in 23 of the 30 lowest-paying jobs in the U.S. Thirty-five percent of women's net job gains during the recovery following the Great Recession were in jobs typically paying \$10.10 per hour or less. Only 20% of men's job gains have been in similar low-wage jobs.¹⁸

In Utah, women make up 82% of healthcare support; 80% of personal care services; 72% of office support; 70% of educational and library workers; and 67% of healthcare practitioners. By comparison, women are only 38% of management and financial service occupations, only 30% of production occupations, and only 26% of material moving occupations--all better paying jobs.¹⁹

A 2019 study of the economic vulnerability of female health workers in the United States found that 35% earned less than \$15 per hour, well below a living wage. A total of 1.7 million female health care workers and their children live in poverty. Raising the minimum wage to \$15 per hour would reduce poverty rates among these female health workers by as much as 50%.²⁰

Educating women as a solution to the wage gap problem. Feminists have long encouraged women to seek more education, believing that the most effective way to protect women from falling into poverty is to give them access to higher education. College-educated women do earn more than non-college educated women, but despite greater investments in education, women have remained concentrated in lower-paying jobs such as health care support, personal and care services, and teaching.

Utah's average teacher pay (\$47,604) is significantly lower than the national average, and, on average, teachers earn less than three-quarters of what private sector professionals with bachelor's degrees in other fields earn.²¹ Largely because of this, the average annual teacher attrition in Utah is approximately 11 percent.²² Increasing the salaries of women educators and librarians (both public and private), would improve the earning power of 1 in 4 full-time, year-round female workers in the state.²³

Encouraging women to become educated in a greater variety of fields has led to a teacher shortage. Because policy makers are unwilling to recognize educators as worthy of professional pay levels, more women have chosen other, better paying occupations in law, medicine, and business. This trend then creates a new problem. The wage differential between college-educated and non-college-educated women is now greater than the wage differential among men, so the college wage gap among women has contributed to economic inequality in the state, and minority women and men pay an even larger penalty.²⁴

To significantly reduce the wage gap, Utah needs both to increase college-going among women—especially minority women—and to place women center stage in the economic development plans of the state. This means creating job opportunities for full-time work in well-paying jobs. According to the college gap research, investing in technology jobs brings higher wages for men but does little for the college gap among women. In addition, developing the recreation industry in Utah may create jobs, but these jobs do little for the earning power of non-college-educated

women, especially immigrant women. Women--especially non-college-educated women--simply have not benefited from the economic growth Utah has experienced in recent years.²⁵

Policy makers dismiss many of the low-paying occupational choices of women as irrational and ineffective; yet the economy is dependent upon the work they do in the occupations they choose. If policy makers want to reduce the gender wage gap, they need to increase the wages of teachers, incentivize the creation of year-round, well-paying jobs for both college-educated and non-college educated women, invest in childcare services for *all* employed women, and increase the minimum wage.

The Motherhood Penalty.²⁶ Research has long demonstrated that much of the wage gap is a function of discrimination. Women are paid less because they are women. Sociological research has found some of that discrimination arises from a significant wage penalty for having children. Some researchers argue that having and raising children interferes with the accumulation of human capital and women's level of productivity, while other research suggests employers believe without evidence that mothers are less competent or less committed to their jobs than are childless women.

Studies have found average wage penalties ranging from five to ten percent per child among women in their 20s and 30s.²⁷ Thus, given the emphasis on families and children in Utah, some portion of the wage gap is likely due to the motherhood penalty.²⁸ Ironically, the same research indicates that employers are much more willing to offer flexible time and higher wages to fathers, believing fatherhood makes a person stable and reliable, while believing motherhood is a distraction for female employees. Employed women, meanwhile, seek flextime policies *to improve their reliability* at work as they struggle to juggle the unpaid, and often unpredictable, care work for which they continue to be ultimately responsible.

Racial and Ethnic Minorities

Just as Utah women make vital contributions to the state's economy, Utah's diverse racial and ethnic minority populations underpin the state's history and economic vibrancy. Utah has always been home to members of the Navajo, Ute, Paiute, Goshute, and Shoshone tribes, and has had a thriving African American population, which, though historically small in number, has grown by 44% in the last decade.

In addition to those minority families that have lived in the area for generations, there are growing numbers of Latinx, Pacific Island, African, and Asian immigrants who have made Utah home more recently.²⁹ The Hispanic population is now 14 percent of Utah's total population, and in the last decade, Utah's minority population has grown 32 percent--twice the total population growth for the state overall (16%).³⁰

Today, Utah's minority communities account for approximately 20 percent of the state's population, with 1 in 5 Utahns, 1 in 4 Wasatch Front residents, and 29% of Salt Lake County residents identifying as racial minorities.³¹ "The Wasatch Front labor force is gradually becoming more diverse as the shares of all minority groups but one (American Indian) are increasing."³²

Like women, racial minorities who live along the Wasatch Front are underrepresented in the professions and overrepresented in the service occupations. Minority women are especially underrepresented in the skilled craft category (where they could make better wages),³³ and whatever wage penalties women face more generally, the penalties for minority women and men are dramatically greater.

Increasing diversity in Utah and along the Wasatch Front translates into an increasingly diverse labor force. Some estimate that by 2065, only 65% of Utah's population will be non-Hispanic white.³⁴ Low college enrollment and completion rates of Utah minorities aged 18-35 will have a substantial impact on Utah's skilled labor force, with major implications for employers.³⁵

While employers will need to respond to the changing demographics of the Wasatch Front, policy makers and employers alike must educate themselves to understand the racial and ethnic inequalities that face racial and ethnic minority community members and implement policies that ameliorate those inequalities. The COVID-19 pandemic,³⁶ the successes of the Black Lives Matter movement,³⁷ and the activism of black athletes³⁸ are all bringing greater awareness of social and economic inequalities in our society; without a measured, future-focused plan to integrate minorities and reduce education and wage gaps, the social unrest seen in Utah in 2020 will not go away. Policy makers and regional employers must engage new "practices that support and provide opportunities for the changing local population."³⁹

Understanding the Historic Roots of Racial Inequality. Racial inequality in America began with the institution of the Atlantic slave trade by Portuguese royalty in the fifteenth century,⁴⁰ and the efforts of a royal chronicler, Gomes de Zurara, to create a *hierarchy of power*, describing the enslaved Africans with negative qualities to justify their brutal treatment.⁴¹ When Spanish and Portuguese colonizers subsequently arrived in the Americas, they called all indigenous peoples "'Indians,' or *negros da terra* (Blacks from the land)," distinguishing them from Africans, thus normalizing and rationalizing "the increased importation of the supposedly 'strong' enslaved Africans and the ongoing genocide of the supposedly 'weak' Indians in the Americas."⁴²

Then, beginning in 1735, "Carl Linnaeus locked in the racial hierarchy of humankind in *Systema Naturae*," color-coding the races as White, Yellow, Red, and Black, attaching each race to one of the four regions of the world, and ascribing characteristics to each.⁴³ White people, at the top of the hierarchy, were described as vigorous, muscular, smart, inventive, and ruled by law; black people, at the bottom of the racial hierarchy, were described as sluggish, lazy, flat nosed, covered by grease, and ruled by caprice.⁴⁴ This taxonomy was created and perpetuated to justify the disparate and indefensible treatment of people based solely on the color of their skin.⁴⁵

"Thus, powerful economic, political, and cultural self-interest--the accumulation of wealth in the case of royal Portugal and subsequent slave-traders--precipitated the racist policies, and then influential intellectuals produced the racist ideas in an attempt to justify the racist policies of their era and to redirect blame for their era's racist policies away from those policies and onto people [of color]."⁴⁶

Such biological racism rested on two myths: that the races are *meaningfully different in their biology* and that these differences “*create a hierarchy of value*,” which took five centuries to categorically and indisputably discredit. Finally, in 2000, the first survey of the entire human genome was completed, proving that in genetic terms, all human beings, regardless of race, are more than 99.9 percent the same.⁴⁷ Thus, the most fundamental fact of life on this Earth is our common humanity.⁴⁸

Tragically, basic economic fairness, dignity, and opportunity are still being denied to the members of racial and ethnic minority communities in Utah and across the globe, and for Utahns, at least, those disparities are largely invisible to the majority white population. As Robin DiAngelo, author of *White Fragility: Why It is So Hard for White People to Talk About Racism*,⁴⁹ poignantly noted in a recent TED Talk: Most of us “were born into white neighborhoods, went to predominantly white schools, studied, learned, worshipped, loved, worked and died in a segregated society without having any consistent on-going authentic relationships with persons of color, and without having a single person who loved, mentored, or guided us suggest there was any loss—that there was any inherent value in the perspectives or experiences of people of color. If our parents, schools, curriculum, teachers or governments saw value in those perspectives, we would have been given those perspectives, and we weren’t; and that has shaped what we care about, what we value, what we see, what we don’t see, who we build our lives with, and who we don’t build our lives with; and that is the level at which we must look inside ourselves, inside of our institutions, and inside our public policies.”⁵⁰

“Having lived our whole lives in a system in which white people are seen as central and inherently superior to people of color, our personalities and worldview were formed in that system. We did not choose it. It isn’t our fault. We do not need to feel guilty about it or look for anyone to blame for it,” but “we are responsible for changing it; because the current default of our society is one that reproduces inequality; and once we recognize it, we have a duty to address it.”⁵¹ We cannot simply carry on as we always have because inaction then becomes complicity.

Wealth and Economic Viability. Barriers to wealth accumulation are a perfect example of one of the most insidious ways people of color have been disadvantaged based on the color of their skin. Wealth is an important measure of economic health. When families have sufficient wealth, they can utilize income earned in the past to meet spending demands in the future, making them economically better off. They can afford to send their children to college; they have a buffer of economic security against periods of unemployment; they can take risks like starting a business; and they have the wherewithal to finance a comfortable retirement and possibly even provide an inheritance for their children.⁵² Unfortunately, the ability to accumulate wealth is much more challenging in minority communities.

To construct wealth, two primary building blocks are required:

- Steady, well-paid employment during one’s working life, to permit a decent standard of living plus the ability to save, and

- Access to well-functioning financial markets that provide a healthy rate of return on savings without undue risks.⁵³

Minority populations, however, are less likely to acquire these building blocks; because of this the typical (median) wealth for white families in the United States (\$171,000) is almost 10 times greater than for black families (\$17,150).⁵⁴ Likewise, the median wealth of white households was estimated to be eight times that of Hispanic households in 2017.⁵⁵

The inability of blacks to create wealth derives from generations of public policies which denied African Americans the same opportunities as whites (e.g., slavery, mismanagement of the Freedman's Savings Bank (1874), the Tulsa Greenwood District Massacre (1921), Jim Crow (1870-1968),⁵⁶ the exemption of domestic agricultural and service occupations from the New Deal (1933 and 1939), the GI bill's discriminatory implementation (1944), and redlining by banks.⁵⁷ Efforts to curb these practices began with the 1968 Fair Housing Act and the 1977 Community Reinvestment Act, but the rules of those earlier eras undergird today's economy, reproducing the same racial inequities 150 years after the end of slavery and more than 50 years after the end of Jim Crow segregation.⁵⁸ The lost opportunities of several generations mean far fewer assets available to transfer to the next generation.

More than 25% of black households have zero or negative net worth, compared with less than 10% of white families, and these differences persist and are growing, even after taking age, household structure, education level, income, and occupation into account. Educational attainment, the right occupation, and full-time employment are necessary, but not sufficient conditions for building wealth. Median wealth in black families with a head of house who holds a college degree is only one-eighth the median wealth of similar white families.⁵⁹

Housing equity makes up about two-thirds of all wealth for the typical household, and the racial wealth gap is primarily a housing wealth gap. Although most official discriminatory housing policies have finally been dismantled, as noted above, the lack of wealth accumulation has kept the racial wealth gap from closing, and discriminatory practices have persisted.⁶⁰ The housing bubble brought on by predatory high-interest lending that occurred prior to the Great Recession, along with high rates of unemployment after the bubble burst, left many African American families starting over in their efforts to accumulate wealth.⁶¹

Hispanic populations have similarly found it difficult to accumulate wealth. For example, U.S-born Hispanics experienced a 7% decline in median wages after the Great Recession and continued to struggle through 2013. By 2017, median wages had returned to pre-recession levels, but the intervening years had taken their toll, reducing overall economic health.⁶²

Minority communities suffer more during economic downturns because they have so few resources in reserve. The role of public policy in creating and maintaining the racial wealth gap makes it clear just how difficult it will be to close the gap through the individual choices and behaviors of members of Utah's minority communities. "Malign social policy has created and maintained the racial wealth gap, and only a progressive reorientation of this policy can close

it...”⁶³ The 2020 recession has again put minority communities at acute economic risk; and the racial and ethnic wealth gap needs to be addressed in policies to rebuild Utah’s pandemic-weakened economy.

Disparate Impacts of COVID-19. The COVID-19 pandemic is also spreading far faster among communities of color in Utah and has proven substantially more lethal, with minorities being infected, hospitalized, and killed at higher rates per capita than the state’s predominately white population.⁶⁴ “‘We know that our health care system has disparities,’ said state epidemiologist [Dr.] Angela Dunn during a daily media briefing earlier this year, ‘and this pandemic is shining a particularly bright light on those....It is inequitable access to tests and health care, in general,’ Dunn acknowledged, ‘that’s at least partially to blame for the racial disparity of those impacted by the virus.’”⁶⁵

The Latinx community has been the hardest hit in Utah. “Many in this community haven’t had access to medical care for years and haven’t been able to address underlying health concerns that exacerbate the virus’s impact,” said Dr. Dunn.⁶⁶ The data also reflect higher rates of hospitalizations and deaths in the Latinx community—and across all people of color combined in Utah.⁶⁷ “Our Hispanic communities are bearing a bigger burden than others,” Dunn said.⁶⁸

Utah’s Pacific Islander community has also been disproportionately impacted by COVID-19. “Jake Fitiseanu, a Samoan-Chinese American councilman in West Valley City, stated that the disparities are not surprising because they represent decades long mistreatment and segregation in the U.S. healthcare system. ‘Historically, there definitely is precedent for lack of health care access, lack of language-specific and culturally-responsive health outreach,’ he said. ‘It’s just tragic it hasn’t been fixed.’”⁶⁹

Jeanetta Williams, President of the NAACP in Salt Lake City, reported concerns that, despite being a small percentage of the overall Utah population, Black residents would also be disproportionately impacted because many have diabetes, hypertension, or asthma, which could make them sicker if they contract the illness.⁷⁰ In addition, many African Americans are hired to work part-time and don’t have health benefits at their jobs.⁷¹

In a recent study, University of Utah Professor Daniel Mendoza, found that Zip Codes with a higher minority population and lower-income households had almost 10 times as many COVID-19 cases.⁷² “‘We believe an important factor that drives this [data] is that lower-income households are generally employed at essential jobs and therefore can’t stay at home,’ Mendoza said.”⁷³ “We must remember that the COVID-19 pandemic is not the first, nor will it be the last, global health crisis; and we must think of how to better prepare for the next one and how we can protect those who are most vulnerable.”⁷⁴

Civil Unrest and Utah’s Response. The summer of 2020 will be recorded as a divisive period of protests and counter protests resulting from multiple police shootings of black men (and women), the most notable being George Floyd in Minneapolis and Jacob Blake in Kenosha, Wisconsin. In Utah, protests centered on the shooting of Bernard Palacios-Carbajal by Salt Lake City Police. In

this year's Personal Security Report, we address issues relating to criminal justice reform, which is a critically important component of the work before policymakers in addressing the needs of minority communities. Such reform efforts cannot succeed, however, in the absence of well-paying employment opportunities, access to safe and affordable housing, access to good schools, reliable transportation, childcare, health care, and community-conscious safety and emergency services.

LGBTQ Individuals

Discrimination against lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and queer (LGBTQ) citizens not only hurts the individuals themselves, but also hurts their families, the companies they work for, and the states they live in.⁷⁵ A large and growing body of research documents the economic effects of violence, discrimination, and social stigma experienced by LGBTQ individuals, which limits their access to jobs, schooling, health care services, and political participation. All of these impacts create barriers to full participation in the economy and reduce economic output.⁷⁶

LGBTQ-inclusive policies and practices, meanwhile, have been shown to have a positive impact on a company's bottom line and ability to attract and retain talent. Greater job satisfaction and well-being among employees creates a more productive workforce.⁷⁷

In Utah, some progress has been made in affirming LGBTQ rights. Utah's Anti-Discrimination and Fair Housing Act, effective May 5, 2016, modified state law to include "sexual orientation" and "gender identity;"⁷⁸ and the United States Supreme Court's landmark decision in *Bostock v. Clayton County*, issued in June 2020, affirmed that Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 protects employees from discrimination based on sexual orientation and gender identity.⁷⁹ Utah companies will likely face more charges of workplace and housing discrimination, however, unless their current practices are reformed to comport with current law. In 2009, there were 107 claims of discrimination (of all types) in the State of Utah; and in 2017, there were 264.

In 2019, Utah also strengthened its hate crimes bill, responding to the number of LGBTQ people who have been the target of hate crimes in Utah. The bill allowed judges to increase penalties for a crime if a defendant is convicted of targeting someone based on ancestry, disability, ethnicity, gender identity, national origin, race, religion, or sexual orientation. The new law serves as a powerful tool in protecting marginalized groups and persons, including LGBTQ individuals.⁸⁰

It is estimated that close to four percent of Utah's adult population are likely LGBTQ-identified individuals. Population estimates indicate 4.48 same-sex couples per 1000 households (Utah ranks 30th among the states) with 20% of these households raising children.⁸¹ Thirty-five percent of LGBTQ-identified Utahns are college educated, like Utahns generally (34.8%).

The most pressing problem currently facing Utah's LGBTQ community is addressing the needs of young people who are struggling with sexual orientation and gender identity. Families and youth without sufficient resources to deal with such issues are at a particular disadvantage. In addition,

bullying remains a serious problem in schools everywhere; and a national survey found 34 percent of LGBTQ students had been bullied on school property while 28 percent had been bullied online.⁸² The State of Utah's 2019 Student Health and Risk Prevention (SHARP) Needs Assessment Survey reports that 29% of gay or lesbian students, 28% of bisexual students and 22% of students who answered "Not Sure" or "Other" regarding their sexual orientation were bullied on school property; and 38% of gay or lesbian students, 42% of bisexual students and 26% of students who answered "Not Sure" or "Other" regarding their sexual orientation were bullied online.⁸³

Suicide ideation remains a serious problem in Utah; and LGBTQ youth are particularly vulnerable. LGBTQ youth contemplate suicide at almost 3 times the rate of heterosexual youth but are almost 5 times as likely to attempt suicide. The CDC reported in 2017 that "the rate of youth ages 10 to 17 dying by suicide in Utah had increased an average of 22.8 percent *each year* from 2011 to 2015." Nationally, the rate increased an average of 6 percent annually over the same period,⁸⁴ suggesting that LGBTQ youth face significantly increased challenges in Utah. Fortunately, Utah policy makers have become focused on this issue in recent years. A Teen Suicide Prevention Task Force was established in January 2018, and the Task Force advocated for and helped pass 11 bills expanding mental health and suicide prevention resources and programs. Also, Utah became the 19th state to ban conversion therapy for minors in 2020.⁸⁵ The Utah Citizens' Counsel commends these efforts and urges ongoing action to break down the remaining barriers to full participation by LGBTQ individuals in our community.

Endnotes for Equal Dignity and Respect for Human Beings Report

¹ “Women This Week: The Gendered Effects of COVID-19”, *Council on Foreign Relations*, April 10, 2020, accessed June 15, 2020, <https://www.cfr.org/blog/women-week-gendered-effects-covid-19>.

² “Social Determinants of Health,” *U.S. Department of Health and Human Services*, accessed August 25, 2020, <https://www.healthypeople.gov/2020/topics-objectives/topic/social-determinants-of-health>.

³ The Governor’s Commission on the Status of Women was established in March 1973 and continued until 1990 when the Commission’s scope was expanded. The name was also changed to Governor’s Commission for Women and Families.

⁴ In May 2014, House Bill 90 was signed into law creating the Utah Women in the Economy Commission. The purpose was three-fold: 1) increase public and government understanding of the current and future impact and needs of the state’s women in the economy; 2) identify and recommend implementation of specific policies, procedures, and programs to respond to the rights, needs, and impact of women in the economy; and 3) facilitate coordination of the functions of public and private entities concerned with women in the economy. The group has reviewed research on women in higher education and women’s perceptions of economic choices and challenges (four major themes: childcare, job flexibility, benefits--health insurance and paid time off--, and education). The Commission has supported Sick Leave Amendments (HB69), Employer Tax Credit for Child Care (HB187), and Unemployment Insurance Amendments (HB432).

⁵ Originally established at Utah Valley University, the Center moved to Utah State University and boasts extensive research and policy recommendations. Accessed August 25, 2020, <https://www.usu.edu/uwlp/>.

⁶ “The Economic Status of Women in the States,” *Institute for Women’s Policy Research*, accessed August 13, 2020, <https://iwpr.org/>. In addition to employment and earnings (a D grade), the Institute gave Utah grades for Political participation (F), poverty & opportunity (D+), reproductive rights (C-), Health and Well-Being (B), and work and family (F). For example, Utah women earn 70 cents for every dollar a man earns, millennial women in the state experience depression 16.3 more days per year than millennial men, one third of Utah women work in low-wage jobs, and Utah men are 2.5 times more likely to work in STEM occupations than are Utah women. See also, “Utah ranked worst state for women’s equality three years in a row,” *The Salt Lake Tribune*, August 25, 2020, accessed August 26, 2020, <https://www.sltrib.com/news/2020/08/24/utah-ranked-worst-state/>. *Wallethub.com* ranked Utah at the very bottom according to three criteria: Workplace Environment, Education & Health, and Political Empowerment. “Best and Worst States for Women’s Equality,” accessed October 12, 2020, <https://wallethub.com/edu/best-and-worst-states-for-women-equality/5835/>.

⁷ Nancy Folbre, “Measuring Care: Gender, Empowerment, and the Care Economy,” *Journal of Human Development* 7(2005):183-199. See also, Nancy Folbre, *Who Pays for the Kids: Gender and the Structures of Constraint*, (New York: Routledge, 1994).

⁸ Elizabeth M. Legerski and Marie Cornwall, “Working-class job loss, gender, and the negotiation of household labor,” *Gender and Society* 24 (August 2010):447-474.

⁹ The American Association of Retired Persons (AARP) has estimated, however, that 41 million unpaid family caregivers provided an estimated 34 billion hours of elder care—worth \$470 billion—to their parents, spouses, partners and friends in 2017, according to a new report from AARP’s Public Policy Institute. “Recognition of Family Caregivers in Managed Long-term Services and Supports,” accessed October 23, 2020, <https://www.aarp.org/ppi/info-2020/recognition-of-family-caregivers-in-managed-long-term-services-supports.html>.

¹⁰ Ellen McCarthy, et.al., “A working mom’s quarantine life,” *Washington Post*, May 6, 2020, accessed August 25, 2020, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/lifestyle/2020/05/06/coronavirus-pandemic-working-moms-quarantine-life/?arc404=true>.

¹¹ “Data shows inconsistent closures at Utah child care facilities with COVID-19 outbreaks,” *The Salt Lake Tribune*, August 03, 2020, accessed August 26, 2020, <https://www.sltrib.com/news/politics/2020/08/03/data-shows-inconsistent/>.

¹² “2014-2018 Women in the Workforce State of Utah,” Occupations and Industries tab, *Department of Workforce Services*, accessed August 13, 2020, <https://jobs.utah.gov/wi/data/library/laborforce/womeninwf.html>.

¹³ “Child Care Access in Utah, March 2020,” *Work Force Services Child Care*, accessed June 16, 2020, <https://jobs.utah.gov/occ/ccaccess.pdf>.

¹⁴ “Here’s what Elizabeth Warren said during her Democratic convention speech,” *boston.com*, August 19, 2020, accessed August 26, 2020, <https://www.boston.com/news/politics/2020/08/19/elizabeth-warrens-democratic-convention-speech>.

¹⁵ House Bill 187 (Employer Tax Credit for Child Care) was introduced in the 2020 General Legislative Session but was given little consideration.

¹⁶ Derek Miller, “Child Care underpins our economy,” *Utah Policy.com*, August 20, 2020, accessed August 27, 2020, https://utahpolicy.com/index.php/features/today-at-utah-policy/24670-guest-opinion-child-care-underpins-our-economy?fbclid=IwAR3XLkN4DqSXj4IWpM_oysiFmwXM7GRf9Mi3KKDjBULc-H4JbPcbmoe3JTo.

¹⁷ The gap is smaller in neighboring states like Idaho (76), Nevada and Wyoming (80), Arizona (84), and Colorado (86). *Status of Women in the States*, accessed September 1, 2020, <https://statusofwomendata.org/state-data/>.

¹⁸ “Underpaid & Overloaded: women in low-wage jobs,” *National Women’s Law Center* (2014), accessed August 26, 2020, https://nwlc.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/final_nwlc_lowwagereport2014.pdf.

¹⁹ “2014-2018 Occupations and Industries by Gender, State of Utah,” *Department of Workforce Services*, accessed August 13, 2020, <https://jobs.utah.gov/wi/data/library/laborforce/womeninwf.html>.

²⁰ Kathryn E. W. Himmelstein and Atheendar S. Venkatramani, “Economic Vulnerability among US Female Health Care Workers: Potential Impact of a \$15-per-hour-Minimum Wage,” *American Journal Public Health* 109 (February 2019):198-205. The study utilized the 2017 Annual Social and Economic (ASEC) Supplement to the Current Population Survey (CPS). Nearly half of Black and Latina female health workers earned less than \$15 per hour, and more than 10% lacked health insurance. More specifically, home health care aides are undervalued and underpaid nationally. In the U.S. nearly 2 million aides earn an average wage of just \$9.61 per hour. Hours are unpredictable and the part-time work that results means these aides earn a median annual wage of \$13,000 a year. Two assumptions were tested. If raising the minimum wage caused substantial loss of work hours, the \$15-per-hour minimum wage would reduce poverty among female health workers by a smaller, but still substantial amount, 27%.

²¹ “Apples to Apples? How Teacher Pay in Utah Stacks up to the Competition,” *Utah Foundation* (April 10, 2019), accessed August 13, 2020, <https://www.utahfoundation.org/reports/apples-to-apples-teacher-pay/>.

²² “A Vision for Teacher Excellence,” *Envision Utah*, accessed August 26, 2020, https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5c059ead36099b1445c1d246/t/5db71a5ba25a2753b01eb9a8/1572280925100/Vision_for_Teacher_Excellence.pdf. The teacher shortage comes at a time when Utah’s student population is growing by approximately 10,000 students per year. Utah’s increase in school-age population is among the highest in the nation. Without more attention to teacher compensation, class size will grow. Envision Utah has called for increasing new teacher salaries and providing a more calibrated retirement package. In addition, it calls for scholarships to aid Utah college students who want to become teachers.

²³ Women constitute 70 percent of educational instruction and library workers in Utah. One in four employed women are teachers or librarians. By comparison, only 9 out of 100 employed men are teachers or librarians. “2014-2018 Occupations and Industries by Gender, State of Utah.”

²⁴ Leslie McCall, “Gender and the new inequality: Explaining the college/non-college wage gap,” *American Sociological Review* 65(2000):234-255. McCall identified variations that accounted for a substantial gap in wages between college-educated and non-college-educated women (the college gap). Three variables explained one-fifth the variation in the college gap among women: a tight labor market, a

high number of casualized jobs (part-time and seasonal work, as well as women earning income in unincorporated home-based businesses. Rising numbers of technology jobs increased the college gap among men but had little influence on the college wage gap for women.

²⁵ Recently, Utah policy makers, to their credit, have begun to focus on Utah's growing opportunity gap. As a response, Utah has expanded the Utah College Advising Corps and introduced the Utah Promise Scholarship. While an excellent first step, this is only a partial solution.

²⁶ Michelle Budig and Paula England, "The Wage Penalty for Motherhood," *American Sociological Review*, 66(2001):204. See also S. Correll and Bernard, I. Paik. "Getting a job: Is there a motherhood penalty?" *American Journal of Sociology* 112(2007):1297-1338.

²⁷ Other research reveals that the motherhood penalty begins to narrow by the mid-40s; the gap narrows from about \$7500 among women age 27 to about \$2500 by age 45. However, there is evidence that while women with fewer than three children are able to acquire wages equal to the wages of childless women by the time they reach 40, women in their 40s with more than three children continue to pay a 4 percent penalty per child and women in their 50s pay a 6 percent penalty. Overall, the research suggests that having one child never significantly hurts a mother's wages, but a persistent wage penalty for older high-parity mothers cannot be ignored. This is the period of life when mothers face both the financial needs of older children as well as their own need to save for retirement. The findings for women in their 40s and 50s are somewhat suspect, as the motherless category becomes a mixture of women who remained childless voluntarily and those who ended up childless against their own will (e.g., infertility, poor health, the inability to find a suitable partner, or family demands such as caring for aging or disabled relatives).

²⁸ While Utah's total fertility rate fell below replacement levels in 2018 (2.03), Utah's average number of children per family remains slightly above two (2.32), indicating that some Utah women continue to have more than two children. Given the conservative culture of Utah, it may be that older cohorts of women who had larger families continue to experience discrimination because they are mothers. The motherhood penalty, which is most severe for women younger than 40, continues to operate into the 40s and 50s for women with more than three children.

²⁹ Much of this in-migration resulted from the Immigration and Nationality Act of 1965, the Refugee Act of 1980, and the Immigration Act of 1990. The new policies were designed to alter previous immigration laws that limited non-white immigration to the United States, such as the 1882 Chinese Restriction Act, the 1921 Emergency Quota Act, and the Immigration Act of 1924.

³⁰ The term minority refers to those who identify as Hispanic or any race category other than white.

³¹ "U.S. Census Bureau Estimates for Race and Hispanic Origin, Vintage 2019," *Kem C. Gardner Policy Institute, University of Utah*, June 2020, accessed August 27, 2020, <https://gardner.utah.edu/wp-content/uploads/June2020CensusEstRacev2019.pdf>.

³² Emily Harris, "Race/Ethnicity in the Wasatch Front Labor Force: An Equal Employment Opportunity Analysis," *Kem C. Gardner Policy Institute*, June 2019, accessed August 27, 2020, <https://gardner.utah.edu/wp-content/uploads/RaceEthnicity-LaborForce.pdf>.

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ A full 22% of the population will be of Hispanic origin and another 13% will be from a variety of racial and ethnic groups, including 5% identifying as multiracial. Mike Hollingshouse et.al., "Utah's Increasing Diversity: Population Projections by Race/Ethnicity," *Kem C. Gardner Policy Institute*, April 2019, accessed August 17, 2020, <https://gardner.utah.edu/wp-content/uploads/Utah-Projections-Race-Ethnicity-2019.pdf>.

³⁵ The Utah State Board of Regents has recognized the challenge Utah universities and colleges will face to maintain a well-educated work force for the future.

³⁶ See UCC Health Committee Report regarding health disparities and social justice in Utah.

³⁷ *Black Lives Matter Utah*, accessed August 26, 2020, <https://www.blacklivesmatterutah.com/>.

³⁸ "Sports come to a halt: NBA, WNBA, MLB, MLS postpone games as players protest Jacob Blake shooting," *The Washington Post*, August 26, 2020, accessed August 27, 2020, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/sports/2020/08/26/bucks-boycott-nba-playoff-game/>.

³⁹ "Race/Ethnicity in the Wasatch Front Labor Force," 7.

⁴⁰ Ibram X. Kendi, *How to be an Antiracist* (New York: One World, 2019), 39.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, 40.

⁴² *Ibid.*, 40-41.

⁴³ *Ibid.*, 41.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.* The full taxonomy reads as follows:

- *Homo sapiens europaeus* at the top of the racial hierarchy, making up the most superior character traits: ‘Vigorous, muscular. Flowing blond hair. Blue eyes. Very smart, inventive. Covered by tight clothing. Ruled by law.’
- *Homo sapiens asiaticus*: ‘Melancholy, stern. Black hair, dark eyes. Strict, haughty, greedy. Covered by loose garments. Ruled by opinion.’
- *Homo sapiens americanus* a mixed set of attributes: ‘Ill-tempered, impassive. Thick straight black hair; wide nostrils; harsh face; beardless. Stubborn, contented, free. Paints himself with red lines. Ruled by custom.’
- *Homo sapiens afer*: ‘Sluggish, lazy. Black kinky hair. Silky skin. Flat nose. Thick lips. Females with genital flap and elongated breasts. Crafty, slow, careless. Covered by grease. Ruled by caprice.’”

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, 42-43.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, 52.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*

⁴⁹ Robin DiAngelo, *White Fragility: Why It is So Hard for White People to Talk About Racism* (Boston: Beacon Press, 2018).

⁵⁰ Robin DiAngelo, “Deconstructing White Privilege,” *General Conference on Religion and Race, United Methodist Church*, 2016, accessed September, 11, 2020, <https://www.gcorr.org/video/vital-conversations-racism-dr-robin-diangelo/>.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*

⁵² Janelle Jones, “The Racial Wealth Gap: How African-Americans have been shortchanged out of the materials to build wealth,” *Working Economics Blog*, February 3, 2017, accessed July 30, 2018, <https://www.epi.org/blog/the-racial-wealth-gap-how-african-americans-have-been-shortchanged-out-of-the-materials-to-build-wealth/>.

⁵³ *Ibid.*

⁵⁴ Kriston McIntosh, et.al. “Examining the Black-white wealth gap” *Brookings*, February 27, 2020, accessed September 1, 2020, <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/up-front/2020/02/27/examining-the-black-white-wealth-gap/>. Wealth is determined by taking the total market value of all physical and intangible assets owned (property, stocks and bonds, savings, automobiles) and then subtracting all debts.

⁵⁵ Rakesh Kochhar and Anthony Cilluffo. “How wealth inequality has changed in the U.S. since the Great Recession, by race, ethnicity and income,” *Pew Research Center*, November 1, 2017, accessed August 28, 2020, <https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/11/01/how-wealth-inequality-has-changed-in-the-u-s-since-the-great-recession-by-race-ethnicity-and-income/>.

⁵⁶ “Jim Crow was the name of the racist caste system that operated primarily, but not exclusively, in southern and border states between 1877 and the mid-1960s. Jim Crow was more than a series of rigid anti-black laws. It was a way of life. Under Jim Crow, African Americans were relegated to the status of second-class citizens. Jim Crow represented the legitimization of anti-black racism...Craniologists, eugenicists, phrenologists, and Social Darwinists, at every educational level, buttressed the belief that blacks were innately, intellectually, and culturally inferior to whites...Newspaper and magazine writers routinely referred to blacks [in derogatory terms]—their articles reinforcing anti-black stereotypes. Even children’s games portrayed blacks as inferior beings... and [a]ll major societal institutions reflected and supported the oppression of blacks.” David Pilgrim, “What was Jim Crow,” *Jim Crow Museum of Racial*

Memorabilia, Ferris State University (2012), accessed September 30, 2020, <https://www.ferris.edu/jimcrow/what.htm>.

⁵⁷ Redlining is a discriminatory practice of denying services to residents of certain areas based on the demographics of the community. The practice began in the 1930s in cities with large black populations (Chicago, Atlanta, Detroit). *See generally* Andrea Flynn et al., *The Hidden Rules of Race* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017); Angela Hanks, Danyelle Solomon and Christian E. Weller, “Systemic Inequality,” *Center for American Progress, February 21, 2018*, accessed July 30, 2018, <https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/race/reports/2018/02/21/447051/systemic-inequality>; Ta-Nehisi Coates, “The Case for Reparations,” *The Atlantic, June 2014*, accessed August 15, 2018, <https://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2014/06/the-case-for-reparations/361631/>; Angela Glover Blackwell and Michael McAfee, “Banks Should Face History and Pay Reparations,” *New York Times*, June 26, 2020, accessed June 28, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/06/26/opinion/banks-reparations-racism-inequality.html>.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*

⁵⁹ “The Racial Wealth Gap.”

⁶⁰ Flynn, et al., *The Hidden Rules of Race*.

⁶¹ The Racial Wealth Gap.”

⁶² Rakesh Kochhar, “Latinos’ Incomes Higher Than Before Great Recession, but U.S.-born Latinos Yet to Recover” *Pew Research Center*, March 7, 2019, accessed August 26, 2020, <https://www.pewresearch.org/hispanic/2019/03/07/latinos-incomes-higher-than-before-great-recession-but-u-s-born-latinos-yet-to-recover/>. *See also* “Systemic Inequality.”

⁶³ *Ibid.* *See also* “Systemic Inequality” and “The Case for Reparations.”

⁶⁴ Courtney Tanner, “Utahns of Color Far More Likely to be Sick, Hospitalized from Coronavirus than White Residents,” *Salt Lake Tribune* April 15, 2020, accessed April 26, 2020, <https://www.sltrib.com/news/2020/04/14/utahns-color-far-more/>. Also see table on page 4 of The Health Committee Report for breakdown of COVID-19 cases by ethnicity.

⁶⁵ *Ibid.*

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*

⁷¹ *Ibid.*

⁷² Norma Gonzalez, “New Study Shows Utah Hispanics Have a Harder Time Distancing During the Pandemic,” *Salt Lake Tribune*, July 15, 2020, accessed July 20, 2020, <https://www.sltrib.com/news/2020/07/15/new-study-shows-utah/>.

⁷³ *Ibid.* “The study also found that the volume of residential traffic in poorer Zip Codes decreased by 10-15% following the ‘Stay Safe, Stay Home’ directive issued by Gov. Gary Herbert, while richer, and largely whiter Zip Codes saw a decrease of 50%. ‘A lot of different factors exist that cause higher cases of COVID-19 in minority and low-income populations, with the biggest being the need to continue working during the pandemic,’ Mendoza said. ‘These jobs generally impose a higher risk because, while an office job may only require close contact with 10-15 people in one day, a cashier at a grocery store can interact with 10-15 people in an hour. In this case, getting tested is a luxury, but it’s a necessary luxury.’”

⁷⁴ *Ibid.*

⁷⁵ Charles Radcliffe, “The Real Cost of LGBT Discrimination,” January 5, 2016, *World Economic Forum*, accessed July 29, 2020, <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2016/01/the-real-cost-of-lgbt-discrimination/>.

⁷⁶ M.V. Lee Badgett, et al., “The Relationship Between LGBT Inclusion and Economic Development: An Analysis of Emerging Economies,” November 2014, *The Williams Institute of Law at UCLA*, accessed July 29, 2020, <https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/LGBT-Inclusion-Economic-Dev-Nov-2014.pdf>. M.V. Lee Badgett, Andrew Park, and Andrew Flores, “Links Between Economic

Development & New Measures of LGBT Inclusion,” *The Williams Institute*, March 2018, accessed August 1, 2020, <https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/publications/gdp-and-lgbt-inclusion/>. The report provides evidence that the inclusion of lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) people is linked to economic performance. M.V. Lee Badgett, “The Economic Case for Supporting LGBT Rights,” *The Atlantic*, November 29, 2014, accessed August 1, 2020, <https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2014/11/the-economic-case-for-supporting-lgbt-rights/383131/>.

⁷⁷ Sara Zellner, and Lawrence Bowdish, “Business Success and Growth Through LGBT-Inclusive Culture,” *U.S. Chamber Foundation Incorporating Inclusion*, April 9, 2019, accessed August 2, 2020, <https://www.uschamberfoundation.org/reports/business-success-and-growth-through-lgbt-inclusive-culture>.

⁷⁸ Utah Code Annotated, Title 34A-5-106, Discriminatory or prohibited employment practices.

⁷⁹ 590 U.S. ___ (2020), slip opinion accessed October 10, 2020, https://www.supremecourt.gov/opinions/19pdf/17-1618_hfci.pdf.

⁸⁰ Taylor Stevens, “Utah is About to Get a Tougher Hate Crimes Law After Final Legislative OK,” *Salt Lake Tribune*, March 13, 2019, accessed July 4, 2020, <https://www.sltrib.com/news/politics/2019/03/13/utah-is-about-get-tougher/>.

⁸¹ “LGBT Data and Demographics,” *Williams Institute*, accessed July 1, 2020, <https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/visualization/lgbt-stats/?topic=LGBT&area=49#about-the-data>. It estimates 3.7 percent of Utah’s population are LGBTQ individuals, approximately 83,000 people.

⁸² “Reducing Bullying and Harassment Endured by LGBTQ Youth,” *Equality Utah*, accessed July 5, 2020, <https://www.equalityutah.org/issues/lgbt-youth#reducing-bullying-and-harassment-endured-by-lgbtq-youth>.

⁸³ “2019 Student Health and Risk Prevention Needs Assessment Survey: Results for State of Utah,” State of Utah, Department of Human Services, Division of Substance Abuse and Mental Health, accessed October 1, 2020, <https://dsamh.utah.gov/pdf/sharp/2019/State%20of%20Utah%20Report.pdf>.

⁸⁴ Luke Ramseth, “As Utah’s Youth Suicide Rate Grows at an Alarming Pace, State Could be Doing More to Combat the Trend, New Federal Report Says,” *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 30, 2017, accessed July 5, 2020, <https://www.sltrib.com/news/health/2017/11/30/utahs-youth-suicide-rates-growing-at-alarming-pace-new-federal-report-says/>.

⁸⁵ Bethany Rodgers, “Utah Enacts Ban on ‘Conversion Therapy’ for Minors,” *The Salt Lake Tribune*, January 22, 2020, accessed July 6, 2020, <https://www.sltrib.com/news/politics/2020/01/22/utah-enacts-ban/>.